

PUBLIC HEARING
Idaho Department of Health and Welfare

PLEASE SIGN IN

ISSUE: COMPLETION AND CORRECTION OF CERTIFICATES

DOCKET NO.: 16-0208-1901

DATE: Thursday, September 19, 2019

TIME: 1:00 p.m. PDT

LOCATION: State Office Building, 1118 F Street, Lewiston, Idaho, 3rd Floor Conference Room

*If possible, please provide us a written copy of your comments to be included in the official record.

NAME (Please Print)	ADDRESS	ORGANIZATION REPRESENTED	DO YOU WISH TO TESTIFY?
DAN COBBIN	1502 CLARK ST COTTAWOOD ID	EMMANUEL BAPTIST CHURCH	YES
STEVEN DUSSEN	LEWIS, ID	D/A	N
Charlie Olson	40192 Southwick Rd Kendrick, ID	Southwick Bible Church	Yes
Sheryl Thayer	Box 187 Olferswood	Olaventy Steam Boats	Yes
Kendall Freir	1187 Longland Rd Grangeville ID	Self & Family	Yes
Jim CHMELIC	227 ST MICHAELS RD COTTAWOOD ID	Self	YES
Diana B. Kirk	912 Bree St. Juliaetta	Meet of society	Yes
Steve Fisher			
Tom Fisher			
Cathy Bennett	463 Boyde Ave. #41, Moscow ID 83843	Self, Family	Yes

9/1/19 Lewiston

[illegible]

Charlie Olson

Kendrick, ID

Sept 19, 2019
Lewiston

On March 5, 2018, the US District Court for the District of Idaho issued a decision holding that Vital Records' practice of categorically denying applications for the amendment of gender markers on a birth certificate violated the constitutional rights of two transgender plaintiffs. (F.V. v. Barron, et al, Case No. 1:17-CV-170-CWD.) The court ordered that Vital Records must begin accepting applications from transgender persons no later than April 6, 2018, and that it must process those applications in a constitutionally sound manner. This rule change establishes the standards and processes for such applications.

This rule change proposes to establish a process for the amendment of a gender marker on a birth certificate. Specifically this rule change requires a notarized affidavit from the applicant; prohibits the marking of the replacement birth certificate as amended; and designates that a previous or concurrent name change must not show revision history, or be marked as amended.

This rule was supposed to have legislative oversight in the 2019 session, but the committee chairmen locked the rule in their drawers, denying legislators any debate or review.

Points of reason:

1) The rule change attempts to change the past. Despite any subsequent decision by the individual, when the birth certificate was created, the individual was identified as a specific biological sex. This identification was not made based on personal preference, but on biological and medical fact. X and Y chromosomes determine male or female, and those genders are readily identifiable at birth by the reproductive organs produced by the genetic markers. The court decision differentiates identification of biological sex and identity of gender, as gender identity may differ from the sex observed and assigned at birth. However true that statement may be, when a child is born, that child is unaware of and unable to express any intrinsic sense of male, female, or other. A subsequent decision to take medical or other actions to create a different gender identity does not have any bearing on the initial fact. The court's own ruling acknowledges that the state's birth records do not identify "gender," but only "sex."

In the decision by the court, the IDHW was permanently enjoined from practicing or enforcing the policy of automatically rejecting applications from transgender people to change the sex listed on their birth certificates. The constitutional violation was automatically denying the request. The state is required to provide a constitutionally-sound approval process. The next parts of the court's ruling are troubling, and I think violation of laws in themselves.

2) The rule change prohibits a factual record of the changes requested. It is indeed an amended record, and to deny such is falsification of a legal document. If the individual chooses to change their gender identity, reflecting that fact in legal records is simply stating the truth, not violating some right of the individual. The court's decision is based on the equal protection clause of the US Constitution, in that some classes of people, such as adoptive parents, can make amendments to birth certificates without record of the amendment on the reissued certificate. This is to protect the privacy of the birth parents and the parental rights of the adoptive parents. I find it hard to equate this with an individual wanting to change their legal identity. The court found there was no rational basis for denying transgender individuals birth certificates that reflect their gender identity. The rational basis is that the identity at birth was based on observed biological and medical fact, not on personal preference or feeling.

3) The rule change prohibits name changes from showing revision history or being marked as amended. As with the previous point, this is simply a factual record, not a judgment on the individual. If other legal name changes (i.e. through marriage, divorce, etc.) are recorded and tracked for purposes of legal identification, this legal name change must also be tracked. The given name at the time of birth is a fact, an accomplished act in the past. If the individual desires a change of name to accompany a change of identity, it does not remove the prior factual identity.

4) Aside from the circumstances of this particular case, there is a problem with the administrative rule process. If a law can be enacted by means of writing an administrative rule, then blocking that rule from being submitted for legislative oversight in the following session, we don't have governance – we have tyranny. A few well-placed individuals are able to forcibly create laws without the due process demanded by the Constitution. A rule that is not taken up for legislative oversight should never automatically become law. It should either be suspended from action or be placed on a docket for review in the next session without the possibility of being locked away or refused review.

(lots of mumbling and background talking)

Facilitator: Morning everyone.

Female 2: Morning.

Facilitator: It's great to see a full house here this morning. Umm. It looks like we still have, maybe, a few people coming in but, in the interest of time, I am going to go ahead and get started. I do want to...

Female 2: Can't hear you.

Facilitator: Assure you...

Female 3: I can't hear you.

Facilitator: You can't hear me? Okay. I will project and I guess that goes for everyone who comes up then also. So, please know we do understand that some of you may have other things to do this morning and may leave during the hearing and that others may be coming in. So, there may be some noise and for those on the phone, we do have a phone up here. It is a listening line only. So, there is a microphone up here for the phone and there is one that we are recording the proceedings on. So, I will go ahead and start with the formal proceedings as people continue to come in.

Let the record show that I am Ducca Disney Spencer, designated facilitator for this public hearing by the Administrator of The Division of Public Health and The Department of Public Health and Welfare. It is 901 o'clock AM on Friday, September 20, 2019. We are in the large conference room of the Region One office in Coeur d' Alene, Idaho and this is the time and place set to receive oral and written comments as provided for in Section 65-5222, Idaho Code for the proposed rule-making under IDAPA 16.02.08 Vital Statistics Rules found in docket number 16-0208-1901. The purpose of this proceeding is to gather facts, views, and arguments from all interested persons relative to the proposed rules so that they may receive consideration by the Department of Health and Welfare. I will accept written statements or documents today in relevant and signed by the persons presenting them. The material will be included as exhibits in the record for this hearing which I will submit to the Administrative Rules Unit following the close of this hearing.

Let the record show that the notice of this hearing was published in the Idaho Administrative Bulletin on Wednesday, July 3, 2019, as required by Section 67-5221, Idaho Code. This publication was timely made and other necessary notice requirements have been met. This public hearing is an informal proceeding. There is no right to cross-examine a person offering comments nor is there a right to counsel or subpoena. No objections or procedures of a technically legal nature will be accepted. As a facilitator, I am the sole regulator of the course the presentations including, but not limited to a determination that the comments are outside the scope of the rule or that comments are unduly repetitious. I am not

here to answer questions or to explain any part of the proposed rules. If you have questions or concerns during this rule making, please contact Elke Shaw-Tulloch at (208) 334-5950. All of those interested persons attending this proceeding are asked to sign in on the roster by the entrance indicating a desire, if any, to make an oral presentation. After a brief statement made by the Department of Health and Welfare summarizing information upon which the proposed action is based, each person will be given an opportunity to speak, at least once prior to any person being heard a second time. If the public attendance is high, as it certainly shows to be and time does not permit a second testimony, the facilitator will limit the testimonies to one testimony per person but, as stated earlier, we will accept written testimony also and we have pens and paper on which to do that. At this time, the Department of Health and Welfare statement will be read into the record followed by the opportunity for oral comments.

There have been two rules in place relating to gender change since early 2018. The first rule was implemented in 2018 in response to a federal court order that required the Department of Health and Welfare to allow people to change their gender on their birth certificate. This rule was in effect as of April 6, 2016 and remains in effect. The second rule, the rule pertaining to today's public meeting, requires that those who want to change the gender on a minor's birth certificate, those under the age of 18, that they must submit a letter from a medical or mental health professional confirming the gender change request is consistent with the gender the minor identifies with. This document is called an attestation. The second rule is currently a temporary rule and is in the process of public comment. Following a series of public hearings this month, the rule will be presented for legislative review during the next legislative session starting in January of 2020. Accordingly, today's hearing provides members of the public with an opportunity to provide comments regarding docket number 16-0208-1901, The Medical Attestation Rule for Minors. We ask that everyone adhere to a set of ground rules established to ensure a smooth and orderly process for hearing from everyone wishing to present today. The ground rules are as follows:

1. Remain respectful of everyone including those testifying with opinions or perspectives with which you may disagree by not interrupting testimonies or expressing disruptive verbal displays of agreement or disagreement after testimonies.
2. Please do not applaud any speakers comments as this will limit the number of verbal comments that we will have time to hear.
3. Please turn cellphones off or to the vibrate mode during the hearing to avoid distracting others that may be testifying and, if you do need to take a call, please step outside to take or make personal phone calls.
4. Members of the public testifying will need to keep their testimonies to a maximum length of two minutes. This time limit will be strictly enforced by the meeting facilitators to ensure that as many people can provide testimony as possible.
5. Keep comments relevant to the rule at hand, The Medical Attestation Rule for Minors.

6. Lastly, due to the timeframe allotted to receive public comment, we have the paper forms available for members of the public to submit written comments which hold the same weight as verbal comments.

This concludes the department's statement as next, I want to let you know that Ryan, in the back, who is at the registration table, for those of you who come up to speak, he will be holding up a "one minute left sign" and then a "30 seconds left sign." And, fortunately, he is tall so you can see him over everyone (laughter).

He will call out the names and he will do the best he can. Some of them are a little difficult to read so we apologize in advance for that but we will go through everyone who indicated on the roster that they wished to make public comments first. We will then go and ask if anyone else wishes to make public comments. There were quite a few who put a question mark. So, and we also will provide the forms for written comments and we have a whole bunch of pens we can give people.

I also, at this point, wanted to point out, I mentioned that we are recording this. We have a voice-only recording for the public record. I do want to let you know that a couple of people are doing video recordings here as well. I want to let you know, if you are uncomfortable with that, that you can provide us with your written comments and that will take the same. I just want to note that it is being video recorded and I am not sure of the affiliation or what is going to be done with those recordings.

So, because these are being recorded, I will ask that all speakers come to the front and, as you can see, we don't have a microphone, people will need to project. Since it is being recorded, for the record, please state your name, and spell your surname. That will help us make sure that we have properly recorded in all of the comments. Let's see, I think that includes all of my comments. We are now ready to open the hearings and begin taking testimony. So the time is now 9:10 AM and we are ready to start with our first speaker, Ryan.

Mr. Ryan: Rick Whitehead.

Rick Whitehead: Right here?

Facilitator: Yes, right here, please sir. Thank you.

Rick Whitehead: My name is Rick Whitehead, W-H-I-T-E-H-E-A-D. I have been a resident of Idaho since 2011. I fled Texas, this nonsense in Austin 2010. In regards to genders, the bible specifies there are two, our DNA specifies there is only two and if there is still any doubt, you just merely need to look down. I am embarrassed for the State of Idaho that we are expending any budget resources on this discussion at all. Budget dollars are way too tight to be wasting our time on determining something that regardless of our opinion, is irreplaceable. So, I resoundly, say no and any parent since this is in reference to children, any parent, having anything to do with these adjustments or changes is child abuse. But to close, if it is as simple as self-identifying than as I right now, I self-identify as the Governor and this meeting is closed.

Beverly Guenette: Beverly Guenette, G-U-E-N-E-T-T-E, and I am a resident of Coeur d'Alene, and I just feel that biology and science dictates that there is only a male and a female whether you are old, young, or whatever. And, like Rick, today, I identify as 50 pounds less so I am skinny today okay. That is all I have.

Mr. Ryan: We have got Mike Mungy.

Mike Mungy: I will defer for now.

Mr. Ryan: Okay. Ehh, Jerry Hildeman.

Jerry Hildeman: Hildeman?

Mr. Ryan: Uhh, yea, I think so.

Jerry Hildeman: My name is Jerry Hildeman, H-I-L-D-E-M-A-N. I agree with that man right there, that lady right there. They is a male and a female. We are not earthworms. Okay. God made us this way. This is the way it should stay. A question like this being brought up here in the state of Idaho is totally embarrassing to me and it is unjustifiable to even bring this forward. The people that bring this forward are people that are trying to destroy this county, divide it, and change it, and put deception among us. The bible teaches us "who is the leader of deception? That is the devil." I do not want the devil living at my household and I don't want him running my kids. And I hope and I pray that you guys, the people of this state, say no to this garbage, and make sure that it is put to the point where it is "No we do not want it" and the people that are running this state better understand, we the people say "no". Thank you.

Mr. Ryan: Grace Bauer.

Grace Bauer: Hello. My name is Grace Bauer, B-A-U-E-R. I live in the city of Chutney, in Bonner County, and I am here today. I have a little bit of a different take on things. I do believe with the previous speakers, that God created a man and a woman but, if you guys have heard of the medical condition, hermaphrodite or innersex, when a baby is born with both genitalia, I can see this rule letting them grow up to be an adult and then decide what they're going to become. That, in my opinion, is the only reason that, for an allowance, for, to choose a different gender. Being born a woman and identifying as a man or being born a man and identifying as a woman and changing that on a document, in my opinion is fraud and this just really, really bothers me. Umm, I have extensively researched, umm, gender uhh transformation and with children, and when a young male has a surgery, umm, has the bottom surgery, they invert the penis and, if it is not long enough, they take the colon and they extend it and that is a surgery that can never be undone, and just because you identify as one thing over another does not mean that you should be able to do fraud on your documents so, I would like for this rule to be taken away and umm, and for people like this lady said up here, identify as 50 pounds less. If we can change our gender on our birth certificate, can we change the year we were born or the race we are, and you know, so there is so many problems with this and

we are opening up a pandora's box and going down a slippery slope. So, thank you.

Mr. Ryan: Jonna Plante

Jonna Plante: Hi. My name is Jonna Plante, P-L-A-N-T-E. I am confused why there wasn't the rights to negotiate rule making on the April 2018 change. Our rights to decide the laws of Idaho are being removed if decisions like these are being decided by district courts and not heard by the majority of the people who live here and not allowing elected officials to weight in. I am concerned that our state will be changed and manipulated to be politically correct and to bow down to an extremely small percentage of people who have feelings that their biological factors, their chromosomes, and their genitalia they were born with. Facts will always remain. Males have an X and Y chromosome and a female have two X chromosomes and these are facts that should be a permanent part of our record and legal documents that should not be able to be changed due to an opinion or feelings a person has. Legal documents are not to be based on feelings but are based on facts and truth. It is absolutely impossible to change the chromosomes of a male or a female so why would we allow it to be changed on legal documents. It does not matter how much a man or a woman favors something from the opposite sex and feels more at home or comfortable in what society may claim to be more male or female. It is the proof of biological makeup, the genitalia, and the chromosomes of a person that makes them male or female and that's the truth we need to document on legal documentation and allowing the change will destroy the fabric of our society where someone can change a legal document on a feeling is Ludacris.

Mr. Ryan: Rob Behrens.

Rob Behrens: Defer.

Mr. Ryan: Okay. Summer Bushnell.

Summer Bushnell: My name is Summer Bushnell, B-U-S-H-N-E-L-L. I just feel that this ruling is a Band-Aid. It is not solving the actual issue and I would just like to read a little bit of something I found that expresses my opinion. I believe that transgenderism is psychological. Innersex is biological and transgenderism is ideological. I do believe that transgender individuals deserve our love, support, and compassion as do all valuably human beings made in the image of God. They need prayers. I feel like it is a this issue, not down there issue. (giggle). The one study found that 41% of people who identify as transgender ill attempt suicide at some point in their life compared with 4.6% of the gender population. I do know that with youth, this suicide rate is going up and that is what concerns me, this isn't going to fix that rate and the other thing that I thought was interesting is a lot of people say well it is a hostile or a bigoted society, well, in study, even cultures like in Sweden that accept or more accepting of people being transgender, they still have the same suicide rate so I don't think ruling is good because it doesn't fix the actual deep core issue, it just puts a Band-Aid over it. Thank you.

Mr. Ryan: Leslie Duncan.

Leslie Duncan: Oh, written.

Mr. Ryan: Okay. Elizabeth Hunt.

Elizabeth Hunt: I'll defer right now.

Mr. Ryan: Defer. Okay. Krista Duncan.

Krista Duncan: Krista Duncan, D-U-N-C-A-N. Umm. I mean if you want to identify as a different gender, that's fine but I think changing it on your birth certificate is a different story because at the top of your birth certificate, it says this is a certification of vital record and, at the bottom, it says any alterations or

Another male: Erasure.

Krista Duncan: Erasure voids this certificate and I think that it would be falsifying a document to change it. So that is for children, especially, because I don't they are fully developed and know exactly what they want to be or what they are deciding to be. Umm, I think that they can dress however they want but I definitely think that they should wait until their brain is fully developed and ready to make an actual decision and I don't think it should be able to be changed on your birth certificate since it is a certificate of who you were when you were born instead of who you are now. So, I am against changing birth certificates.

Mr. Ryan: Karen States.

Karen States: My name is Karen States, S-T-A-T-E-S, and I just wanted to say that, at this point, I agree with what everyone before me has said. The only thing I wanted to add is that in some of the studies that I have been reading, they have shown that children, minors, who are questioning their identity, if they are left alone to grow up and not pushed into changing their gender, 80% of them remain what they were born and do fine. Those who do change, their suicide rates are higher than their peers.

Mr. Ryan: Katheryn Mazza.

Katheryn Mazza: I am Katy Mazza, M-A-Z-Z-A. The point that I would like to make is that this introduces confusion. When a society does not know who they are at the basic point of gender identification, it reduces the fabric and the stability of that people and this, in my view, is part of an overall, destabilization of a society to the point where if this continues, there will be a very, very shaky foundation and anybody who knows anything about construction, knows that you need a very strong and stable foundation to have anything that is going to be last in the long view. One other thing that I will add, it does not stop with male or female, I have come across young teenagers who have said "I don't want to be either, you are going to call me an it." It doesn't stop. The problem is real and legislation, I do not believe is the answer. The answer lies in the heart of a person and the heart of

society and there are answers to these questions but I do not believe legislation like this is the answer.

Mr. Ryan: Norma White.

Norma White: Hello, I am Norma White. I am from Idaho here. I didn't realize we were speaking to the minor issue but what I have to say does speak to the minors as well and it's even more important because this is an issue of children and no one should be making these kind of decisions for them and I agree with the previous people. But let me tell you why it is problematic to change birth certificates in the first place. For one, it will hinder law enforcement investigations. Number two, it will hinder provision of medical care. There is a recent case of a woman who identified as a man. She went to a hospital for a medical emergency and was treated as a man. Turns out, she was pregnant and her child died because of her misrepresentation of her sex and the hospital staff confirming to her stated identity rather than observable facts. Confirming administrative rules which have the force of law to a person's state of mind or motion regarding a matter which can and often does change over time, undermines the validity of the state's vital statistics collection and documentation and actually perpetuates a lie in every case except for those for whom there is an actual verifiable, unchanging, chromosomal anomaly affecting their sexuality. At its core, this rule represents social engineering, conforming state regulations to a political agenda bent upon transforming societal norms that have successfully guided human society for millennia, will bring cultural and psychological instability and ultimately destruction upon that society. The State of Idaho should not be participating in that transformation at any level or for any reason including a federal law suit. If I am to understand this rule, it is predicated upon a situation of a person who believes his or her gender doesn't match the sex stated on his birth certificate. Hence the person is allowed to change verifiable facts documented on said certificate. Moreover the fact that that certificate has been changed will be hidden from the public, from law enforcement, from medical providers, from someone who may be the victim of a crime perpetrated by that person who, at the time of the crime, was documented as being of a different sex and later is, in other words, this rule could be misused by a criminal endeavoring to cover up his or her identity. Consider the following examples of people identifying as other than they were born. There are now adults who are convinced that they are not adults at all, in their minds they are small children. There is a story. Umm, the next thing. So are we going to write rules that allow people to change their birth certificates to reflect a new birth date? Am I out of time?

Mr. Ryan: You're out of time.

Norma White: Okay. And there are more. (Laughing) Not to mention there are people who think they're animals.

Female: Ma'am

Norma White: Are we going to accept AKC registration instead of (Laughing) birth certificates? (laughing and applause).

Mr. Ryan: Robert White.

Robert White: Robert White, from Idaho Falls, Idaho. One of the things that really concerns me is going back to the judicial system and especially juvenile hall, since we are talking about kids. We have a school system that is pushing confusion onto kids and we see this all over the country happening. This agenda and so if some boy or some girl says I am something else, they get singled out and then they have to go and see a psychologist that pushes stuff. Now one of the things that really concerns me is we have a juvenile justice system and we have a young boy that is confused. He has to go to a juvenile system with the girls and, a lot of times, because of I have had parents that were involved with the juvenile system, they become predators. And now we are going to be endangering other people because of this and also to this from a legal standpoint for the sheriffs and police officers, is they have to be able to track people and track crimes and they won't be able to do this. Thank you.

Mr. Ryan: Roger Berry.

Roger Berry: Good morning. My name is Roger Berry. I live in Blanchard, Idaho. The goal posts are never static. They are arbitrary to begin with and we are never allowed to reach them. It's never enough. We are never enlightened or awoke enough to say "okay, we're there, now people can figure out the rest on their own." There are only two genders, male and female and you developed in the womb to which those you are. Are there more than two genders of deer? Are there more than two genders of horses or chimpanzees? No, there are only two genders of homosapiens also. The two genders have worked very well for a long, long time and they are validated in science unless you believe feelings are more important than science. If you put your hand inside your shirt and tell a psychiatrist you are Napoleon, the psychiatrist will have you lay down on the couch and he or she will start helping you understand who you are in actuality. Tell a psychiatrist that you are a man in a woman's body and you are just as likely to be told to lay down on the couch and if you say the right words, the psychiatrist, instead of helping you come back to who you really are, he or she will actually confuse you further by starting to transition you into something you are not. That is not so much the person's fault for being confused, it's the failure of the medical community and of those people who cultivate the confusion with politics and even the court system. That is truly a sickness, a societal sickness. Babies and children are the most innocent, vulnerable, and dependent members of society. They must be protected and excluded from societal sickness. They are already confused and for their parents and society to twist and confuse them and even physically change them, is vile. It is repugnant beyond measure. There should be a law to keep people from transgendering a child, no differently than we had laws against child molest because that is what it is, it's abuse. Stop it. Umm, I read recently that Ben Carson said big hairy men are trying to get into women's shelters. That's disgusting. Why would we do that? And if you can just say who you are, what you want to be, why should anybody else believe that or go along with it, just because they have an opinion doesn't mean you have to validate who they are and that's

what this law does, it validates feelings and it expects us to enable them to have those feelings. Thank you.

Mr. Ryan: Gayle Goodman.

Gayle Goodman: Gayle Goodman, G-O-O-D-M-A-N, of Post Falls. When I heard about this, I went back through some, oh I am sorry. I went back and found an article that I recently read by a gentleman who had served 20 years in the military and suffered PTSD. During this period of mental health issues, he decided he was a woman and he has now transitioned back. He has gotten help, but he says, I quote, "I should've been treated, instead, at every step, doctors, judges, and advocacy groups indulged my fiction." He now is a counselor for others who are confused and has been able to help a good many number of people and they all say the same thing, "Why didn't anybody help me? Why did everybody just go along with this?" In conclusion, he says, in the last paragraph, that what he really needed was help instead what he got was he was encouraged in his gender dysphoria and told that it was natural when what he really needed was to be seeking therapy. We need to start helping these people and not buying into their fantasy and encouraging them to live out this fantasy. That's why they're committing suicides. They need help. They don't need us buying into the fantasy and that's what this will do and I will leave a copy of this for you. You want a signature?

Female: Yes, please put your name on it.

Mr. Ryan: Tim Castening.

Tim Castening: Good morning, my name is Tim Castening. I live here in Kootenai County and I am representing myself and no other person or organization. I have tried to understand this issue and this issue revolves around two words, sex and gender. It used to be, and I would venture to say that everyone in this room understands that these terms are synonymous, sex and gender, are the same. We are all either male and female and I would also venture to say that everyone in this room knows your biological sex. Gender, now that the terms have been changed, gender can umm, represent anywhere from 80 to 100 mental or psychological conditions, whatever you think that you may be. If you can change your biology on your birth certificate and, by the way, it is a birth certificate, not a mental evaluation, what is your sex or gender at birth? Not something that you become mentally or psychologically later on in life. And, that is where I think a lot of the confusion has taken place, we need to understand that gender and sex are synonymous. That we are either male or female. And here is one of the problems that this could lead to. Should a person change their sex on their birth certificate and there is a homicide, and later on, that a sheriffs department finds a body two or three months later, and this person who had had changed on their birth certificate, their sex or gender (synonymous), are they going to be looking for a male or female. Thank you.

Mr. Ryan: Peggy Perrin.

Peggy Perrin: My name is Peggy Perrin from Hayden, Idaho. This ruling, to me, legitimizes gender, umm, choice. When we have been created, our creator says that we are created in his likeness, we are created male or female. This ruling, to me, legitimizes the insanity that there is a choice that we have to choose either male or female and my statement comes from the authority of the word of God because God is my creator and I think he is the best source in this. He says in Proverbs, "I am wisdom and I live next to sanity, knowledge and discretion live just down the street. The fear of God means hating evil whose ways I hate with a passion. Pride and arrogance and crooked talk. Good council and common sense are my characteristics. I am both insight and the virtue to live it out. With my help, leaders rule and law makers legislate fairly. With my help, governors govern along with all in legitimate authority. I love those who love me and those who look for me find me. Wealth and glory accompany me. Also, substantial honor and a good name. My benefits are worth more than a big salary, even a very big salary and the returns on me exceed any imaginable bonus. You can find me on Righteous Road. That's where I walk at the intersection of Justice Avenue. So, my dear friends, listen carefully, those who embrace these my ways are most blessed. Mark a life of discipline and live wisely. Don't squander your precious life. Blessed the man, bless the woman, who listens to me." Thank you.

Mr. Ryan: Amy Roemelen.

Amy Roemelen: My name is Amy Roemelen, R-O-E-M-E-L-E-N. I am a proud new resident of this great state, having been here six weeks, living in Bonners Ferry. My husband and I prayed for six years to leave California and the lord finally saw fit to get us out of that, choose your word. (Laughing) So imagine, imagine how distressed I was when I got the email from Heather Scott that this was going on here, because of that's what we thought we were leaving behind. This is nothing more than a spiritual attack on this state and on this nation. I used to work in higher education in California and one of the signals that it was time to leave was I had to proofread flags for a student event, 42 different genders and I thought to myself good God what are we doing to our children.

Male: Amen.

Amy Roemelen: Just, its appalling. And then they were going to give me a student assistant who I had to refer to as they because "they" couldn't decide whether "they, them" was male or female. So, we came here to this great state to be in a conservative area, a Christian area, and to fight for what this state stands for and I implore all of you to please don't let them get away with this because this is such a huge, slippery slope, having worked in public education, you guys have no idea what comes after this. It is terrifying what they are doing to our children. It's Cultural Marxism. If you are not familiar with that term, look it up and my heart goes out to these kids that are being brainwashed and purposely confused but we all know the author of confusion is the devil and public education is forcing these beliefs on them and confusing them from the earliest age to not be able to identify who they are or what they are. It's absolute insanity and it's an attack on the spiritual foundation of our nation, our Christian nation, and its being eroded and this is part of that process and this state, we have to stop this. We have to stop

this. We have been here six weeks. That's it. So thank God, I am on Heather Scott's mailing list or else I wouldn't have known about this but I am here to fight with you all. My husband and I are here to support all of you and I just beg you, we have stop this. It is an attack on Christ, its an attack on God, its an attack on the Bible, and its Ephesians 6: "For we wrestle not against flesh and blood but against principalities, against powers, against the rulers of the darkness of this world, against spiritual wickedness in high places."

Mr. Ryan: Rosalee Ingraham.

Rosalee Ingraham: Hi. I-N-G-R-A-H-A-M. And as you can see by my t-shirt, I am a music teacher and so I work with children. I see one of my children over there. I work with children. I work all the way from little ones all the way to adult and I would never, and I have a couple of my students here in the room today and so this is not about you two okay. (Laughter). Okay, but I would never leave this kind of a decision to children that are 18 or under. We all know, scientifically, that the brain isn't even finished until age 25 and so this needs to be honored and this kind of decision-making that is being made by legislatures, it doesn't even make sense. So, I saw a bumper sticker once that said don't be so open minded that your brains fall out. I leave you with that.

Mr. Ryan: Kay Jorissen.

Kay Jorissen: This is Kay Jorissen, J-O-R-I-S-S-E-N. Alright. Let's see. I am here to comment on 1602-08, Vital Statistic Rules In Regard To The Gender Change of Birth Certificates. I feel I am here for myself, my family, my community, parents, women, friends, all around this great state of Idaho. As I strike this section of this altering the gender for any reason other than to make corrections based on biological, physical male female. Although gender identity has gained some footing, we need to be aware of its dangers. Biological identification should always remain on birth records and identifications. Anyone should agree that this confusion could make identifying an individual impossible, and mainly due to proper identification for so many reasons, one being crimes, that is going to have some major contributions to arise in crime and the inability to prosecute. This needs further consideration. It would be detrimental for law enforcement, courts, and victims in rape cases, in cased where biological males would be permitted in biological female facilities, bathrooms, changing rooms, and I would like to add, as a parent of two boys, sometimes I travel by myself with my kids, and it is terrifying to think that I could turn in there and there be somebody else in there other than another mother. Also, we have youth group homes, a female mental hospital wings, women's domestic abuse shelters, and state houses for women and children, jails, prisons, etc. This potentially makes for abusive situations at the blessing of the rule as protection and poses a major safety risk. This does not serve Idahoans well and will not benefit us and this state in any way. This is detrimental as a slippery slope, like many have said, going in the wrong direction. In fact, it has a great risk of being a major threat for violation of person rights, protections of public on so many levels. I mean can you imagine being a victim of a domestic violence case where your severe trust issues and when you have severe trust issues and are placed in a safe shelter to find out your roommate may be a biological male. This

would be a clear violation of this victim's rights. How about our children growing up not knowing who their friends really are or maybe somebody they want to start dating, that's terrifying. The room for abuse of this rule, by those who wish to utilize it for their own perversions and benefit is endless and we cannot stand by watching our culture blur the biological and physical lines of this matter. Finally, there is possibility that one changes their gender identity and then later changes their mind as we spoke of young adults not being fully capable to make good decisions yet. As their life goes on, they may regret this and it I feel like it is ridiculous, frivolous, and this is not up for Vital Record Department. This rule confers no benefit and is not deemed necessary for public interest of Idahoans. Lastly, this rule is not an emergency and Idaho is a free republic and the people do not wish to be regulated by this agency pertaining to gender. Thank you.

Mr. Ryan: Darryl Moore.

Darryl Moore: Very nervous. My name is Darryl Moore and I am very against them forcing this law on us. We was born man or female. That's what God gave us and that's important not to change it.

Mr. Ryan: _____.

Ms. _____: Defer.

Mr. Ryan: Robert Whitehead.

Robert Whitehead: Robert Whitehead, W-H-I-T-E-H-E-A-D. I live in Post Falls and to some extent, I would like to be the last one, I won't be, but I would be like the last one and I would summarize all of the things that have been said, put them all together and what's the bottom line?

Male: No.

Male: No.

Robert Whitehead: The bottom line is a birth certificate is a factual document and facts are facts. You may not like the facts but that's what they are and you ain't going to change them. Okay, a newborn child, when they are born, the fact is they are either male or female and, yes, there may be the hermaphrodite situation but male or female, most all of the time. The person may change their gender identity but that does not change the facts on that birth certificate and, as someone said, to change that, is not only deception but that's fraud. Okay. So, facts are facts and we need to stay with them and that's what God said.

Mr. Ryan: Sam Gallo.

Sam Gallo: Good morning ladies and gentleman, my name is Sam Gallo, G-A-L-L-O, and I am a male, (laughter) so I agree, everything that has been said when I looked at the what this meeting was all about, I broke it down as follows. My wife and I agree on this. We will try to make this simple and to the point. It is

our understanding that in May of 2019, the Idaho Department of Health and Welfare published a temporary rule to allow the indicator of gender to be changed on birth certificates without legislative review. This is very convenient for those who want this rule to become law without public discourse. It is also our understanding that in July of 2019, the Idaho Department of Health and Welfare went even further by changing the rule for children under the age of 18 who want to change their gender. The question is did this change not open the rule to public comment, like we are here today. It was decided that only five counties would be able to voice their concerns about changing gender designation on ones birth certificate and allowing children under the age of 18 to make a decision about changing their gender on their birth certificate. Why only five counties are able to voice their concerns about changing gender designation on ones birth certificate and allowing the children under the age of 18 to make a decision about changing their gender on their birth certificate. Why only five counties from across the entire state are entitled to voice their concern? There are 44 counties in the state of Idaho. The population of these five counties approximates only 23% of the entire population of 1.79 million residents. What about the other 77% that would like to have a say in this? How does this benefit the Idaho Department of Health and Welfare and its director, Dave Jepson, who claims that his departments mission is to promote and protect the health and safety of Idahoans when only three-quarters of them do not have a say in this. How does this benefit the seven republicans and two democrats on the senate Health and Welfare Committee or the eleven republicans and four democrats on the house Health and Welfare Committee. What gives here? We, my wife and I, strongly suggest that these rules be open to public discussion and evaluation to everybody, not just a select group of people. Thank you.

Mr. Ryan: R. L. Perrin.

R. L. Perrin: R .L. Perrin, P-E-R-R-I-N, and I live in Hayden, Idaho and for everything that everybody has said, the thing that concerns me is how did we get to this point? How did we get to the place in like the last gentleman said? Sorry about that, is we need to be more aware now than we have ever been before because the silent majority is not gaining anything and that's why I urge you to start looking into what's going on, not only for ourselves but for our kids and for our grandkids and the generations that are going down because things are happening right now that are going beyond repair, that we cannot stop it without greater fight so I just encourage you to start finding out what is happening, not just in our community, not just of our providence where we are, but the whole state and the United States of America and believe that and with prayer, I am a Christian. I believe in the lord, is that through this and start saying God, what is my part, give me a voice and start praying for other people around that have a voice that they will start speaking for our nation and how we feel in there and I believe that will make a change if we all gather together, not single ourselves out but come together as a community, come together as a family, and start standing for what we believe is right in the lord's name. Thank you. I kind of wrecked it for you didn't I?

Female: No, I think we got it.

Mr. Ryan: Jeanette Brown.

Jeanette Brown: Hello, my name is Jeanette Brown. I wasn't going to speak but, like the previous lady from California, the teacher, my husband and I escaped California, because of this madness and then, for Idaho to be, for Idaho to be weighted down to California and the rest of the nation with all of this madness and all of this sin, its just insanity and we need to stop it. Umm, a delusion is a belief that contradicts reality and pushing this agenda of delusion is not truth and the fantasy of all of these people, they need help are sick and if we don't come together and put an end to all of this crock, we are going to be just like California and that's why we moved here to escape the madness. Its insanity and everybody needs to be aware of what's going on and put up a damn wall if here.

Mr. Ryan: Anna Britt.

Mr. Ryan: Maureen Paterson.

Male: What was the other name?

Mr. Ryan: Anna Britt.

Mr. Ryan: Maureen Paterson.

Maureen Patterson: Maureen Paterson, P-A-T-E-R-S-O-N, one "T". We're from Priest River area. I had a friend who wanted to come but she said to stop if they would just look at the map of Idaho and realize that Coeur d'Alene is not the northern edge. (laughter) So, I will say, her name is Michelle Rohrer, and she says "those of us who oppose unscience-based gender fabrications by radical special interest groups are not being given fair and just representation." And then for myself, I'd like to say that John Hopkin's Hospital has terminated given any of these transition operations anymore because of they have found out that if you just leave the child alone, a person alone, they will go back. An alternative to that is twenty times higher suicide rates. So, this is a legal government document, why are we pandering to that insanity? Thank you.

Mr. Ryan: Doug Paterson.

Doug Paterson: Doug Paterson, one "T", P-A-T-E-R-S-O-N. Yes, I want to first say that I agree with what everybody has been saying and, in terms of that, is there anyone here who is going to speak in favor of them doing this craziness?

Male: You are not supposed to interact.

Doug Paterson: Which, so I would say, again, this birth certificate is a historical document. It is based on the observation of trained professional physicians as to what the sex of that child is on birth. They keep that data for a reason. There is governing reason to know how many males and females are being born and to change that, to change that willy nilly, to allow parents to change that for minors is

just fraud. It is fraud on government document and it is also child abuse. So, that's what I got to say. Thank you.

Mr. Ryan: Wren Cramer.

Wren Cramer: My name is Wren Cramer, C-R-A-M-E-R. I am from Sagle, Idaho, and I have to address the people here, not the legislatures and I ask myself this question, is how does 1% of the population garner so much power? Because of we allowed it to happen. And I am as guilty as everybody else in this room and we need to stop it. I heard somebody else say "that majority does not work anymore" and that's true. You know, my wife and I are Christians and we need to put God back in our schools and the ten commandments need to go back into our courts and we, we need to be the shining light on the hill for not just Idaho, not just to shine down to Boise, but for the US. All of these people are moving to Idaho because they believe that we have this thing and we are sitting here saying this thing is being taken away and we need to take it back. Thank you.

Mr. Ryan: Jennifer Cramer.

Female: Can I go too? I put both of us.

Mr. Ryan: Oh yea, sure, go ahead.

Jennifer Cramer: Hi, my name is Jennifer Cramer, C-R-A-M-E-R, and I guess I ask myself what is the true purpose of this rule change and, in my opinion its simply to serve the ideologically minority, which is clearly the minority. I don't know that I have anything necessarily new to say what other people have already said but it is, it's a legal document. You can't change history. You can't change the facts. This is a psychological heart issue that legislation is not going to fix, it will only make it worse. We are born male or female. God created us that way. The children are, he especially loves the children and how dare the adults that are trying to correct these children and convince them that, "sure, you aren't a male, you not a female, you're whatever you are," is just, it just breaks my heart. And then, somebody else mentioned this, just from a, a practical perspective, the waste of time and money and energy being spent to serve this very small minority who wants this and then to the legislature, there was 22 counties that requested hearings on this and they only allotted in five, why? So, thank you.

Mr. Ryan: Eric Sealy.

Eric Sealy: I'm Eric Sealy, I'm a father, husband, a former pastor here in the Coeur d'Alene community, Kootenai resident home owner and business owner, California refugee of twenty years ago, and if you were to have told me twenty years ago we were going to be here having this discussion, I would have called you nuts and now we're nuts as the people. I want to start with by whose authority in my speaking, and I want to speak on my own authority. With the limited time I have, I want to speak on behalf of the lord on who is our maker, the creator. You can deny him all day but he does exist and he said in Genesis 1:27: God, created man in his own image, in the image of God he created him, male and female, he

created them. Then God blessed them and said to them, be fruitful and multiple. Wait, are we trying to screw up that whole multiple thing? Oh, we are. Wait, are we trying to dictate to God, our creator, that we know better? Oh, we are. Interesting. How far are we going? This is the same God, did you know that the preamble of the Idaho State Constitution where the Department of Health and Welfare gets its authority, where the legislator like John Green gets their authority has this to say, at the preamble of the constitution of the State of Idaho, it says "We the people, of the State of Idaho, grateful to who? All mighty God. Almighty God for what? For our freedom, to secure its blessings, and promote our common welfare. Welfare. That's why we even have a state constitution to establish this constitution. My question, men and women, fathers and mother, is why are we taking our hard-earned tax dollars and giving them over to our enemies? Why are we funding the Health and Welfare system? The agency that is destroying us. How stupid are we? We are funding them and saying here, here is more money. Why aren't we gutting their funding? To shoot us as an Idaho people, to tell other California refugees who are coming here, fleeing and saying ahh "welcome to the new California." Shame on our legislature. Thank God for John Green, thank God for Idaho, Heather Scott, and others, but you, you are the minority. We need more legislators to get a backbone and gut the funding. God bless you. But this agency, this agency, nonelected agency. I was here two weeks ago, guess what, full packed house. What, this same Health and Welfare agency is utilizing the CPS against parents so, again, my. We are funding our enemies. Ridiculous.

Mr. Ryan: Rebecca Huseby.

Rebecca Huseby: Hi, I'm Rebecca Hughesby from Bonners Ferry, Idaho. H-U-S-E-B-Y. And I'm going to speak loud enough so hopefully all of you can hear what I have to say. Most of you have said what I came here to say, in fact, he just quoted what I was going to quote. However, there is a couple of things that haven't been said yet. One, is if I surgically had a trunk attached to my face, can I go back and on my birth certificate say I was born an elephant? If I surgically had large ears attached to my head and I went back and said I want my birth certificate to say I was born a donkey, does that make me a donkey? If we can change the vital statistics of our birth, then we can change the birth certificate of America, the constitution. If that happens, folks, there will be no United States of America. If I have a bottle of poison in my hand, I can call it apple juice if I want to but, if I drink it, it's going to kill me no matter what I believed it was because truth is truth whether it's believed or not. Thank you.

Mr. Ryan: Alex Taylor.

Alex Taylor: My name is Alex Taylor, T-A-Y-L-O-R, and I am from the city of Sand Point. I would like to say it's a pleasure to speak in front of the Governor of Idaho and such a lovely collection of farm animals, attack helicopters, and skinny people. To start off with, I would like to say that I think the policy as it stands is sound rule making. I think that the amendment that's being made is necessary. Speaking from my own experience as a trans-person in northern Idaho, I would like to say that my main concern in regards to the amendment is the lack of quality and readily available healthcare for trans-folks in the Idaho panhandle. It's been my

experience that I've had, I have a good friend of mine whose had a hard time finding a competent healthcare professional who can help her to continue her hormone therapy that she began years ago. I know several young people in the city of Sand Point who could benefit greatly from counseling services that are experienced, compassionate, and conversant in gender studies and trans-health issues. I would like to encourage the Idaho Department of Health and Welfare to turn an eye towards increasing the availability and the quality of trans-healthcare in the panhandle. Whether that takes the form of increasing visibility for already existing care or perhaps encouraging continuing education for care that already exists. I would like to say thank you very much for your time now and I would like to make you an open invitation, I am the only trans-person in this room as far as I know and what I would like to say is that if any of you would like to get coffee sometime, if you would like to sit down and you would like to talk to a trans-person to understand our experience better from a firsthand perspective instead of an article, it would be a pleasure. You can find me on Facebook at Alexander Taylor or you can stop in at Trinity City Beach, I'm the bartender there. I would love to talk to any of you. Thank you.

Male: God bless you.

Mr. Ryan: Howard Kuhns.

Howard Kuhns: My name is Howard Kuhns, K-U-H-N-S. I didn't know what I was in for when I came here. My wife said please don't get yourself in the newspaper. But I've been greatly encouraged by the comments. One thing that has not been said that is the bible makes it clear that because of the sin of Adam, the entire creation is under a curse and part of the way that works out is that people don't always develop normally. I went to high school with a kid who had a little short arm. He called it the club. I have a cousin who was born with clubbed feet and two fingers on one hand. Some people are born with a cleft palate. But we are all born either XX, female, or XY, male. I don't know what yours is but it is one or the other and that is a fact and that is the way that it should be on the birth certificate. If we make laws based on the things that are not normal, we will shoot ourselves in the foot. We need to understand that there is an order of creation and it's male and female. Thank you.

Mr. Ryan: Mary Swoboda

Female: What? Say it again?

Mr. Ryan: Mary Swoboda

Female: Oh boy. (Laughter)

Mary Swoboda: My name is Mary Swoboda, S-W-O-B-O-D-A. I agree with everyone but, and I am really glad that somebody explained why our elected representatives are not making these rules but they seem to be coming out of agencies within our government and that's not right as far as I am concerned. And I do have some information, Governor Little, has been making the rounds of small

towns in the area, and he will be in Rathdrum on Thursday, the 26th, from 10 to 3, at the Lutheran Church. He is going to be bringing a contingent of department heads from the state that will be there so, if you get a chance, come on down and talk to your governor.

Mr. Ryan: Rachelle Audison.

Rachelle Audison: First off, I would just like to say that I'm pleasantly surprised at how loving that everyone is in their disagreement on this matter. I, myself, am a refugee from western Washington, where I felt like we had to be armed to go to the bathroom. I had some friends of my daughters who were terrified to be in the bathroom. They had men coming into the bathrooms and they just were scared. Do we really wanted to tell our young girls that they are safety does not matter? Do we want to tell our young boys and men that manhood does not matter? Anyway, I just want to remind everyone of the story of the Emperor Has No Clothes, where people were all like oh yea, yea, that's the truth, we'll go along with that and it took a child to say why are you guys all lying? Why are we going along with this? It's not the truth. So some people might want, wish, and even think that they are a different sex so then they were genetically conceived but that doesn't alter reality or make it truth. They have a right to think and believe that they are the opposite sex or some other whatever, but I have a right to believe that I am an eagle if I want. I can even intimidate or even convenience 51% of the people in Idaho that I'm an eagle. That they could pass a law that says Rachelle Audison is an eagle. That doesn't mean that I am going to have feathers, that I can fly or that I'm an eagle. Anyway, so no one has the right to use the government and the force of law to make others go along with their untruth and their counterfeit that they wish to believe. And, if you can change a birth certificate based on current and changing ideology, the birth certificate becomes meaningless and useless. What's even the point of it? Regarding minors, children should be able to depend on their parents and their community to guide them towards truth and their ultimate best interest through this time of exploring what they wish to become in life. Parents and other adults should not commit them to this confusion and counterfeit. It's, it is child abuse, I agree with that. And, lastly, we aren't doing anyone any favors by supporting and enforcing this confusion. That isn't compassion. That isn't loving our fellow beings.

Mr. Ryan: Doug Duncan.

Doug Duncan: Doug Duncan, D-U-N-C-A-N. I just want to reiterate a couple of the points about the legal side of this. The document is....

Female: Speak up please.

Doug Duncan: The document was created at the point of birth. It was a factual document that was recorded by all of those who were witness to it and they all signed the validity of it. To let anybody come in later and, on a whim, change that document, and overwrite all of the witnesses that were at the scene at the time, is ludicrous. So, you know, just because of some bureaucrat in the office of, you know, Health and Welfare, comes up with a new rule and just said we are going to do it

this way, anybody who is doing this should be charged with falsifying documents or altering legal documents. It wrecks the fabric and the validity of the vital statistics that are there. If we can change that, why do we just spend millions of dollars going through this whole, we have to redo our driver's license and show up with our birth certificate as the founding document proving who we are and where we were born if we can go change that then why do we just have all of this other system put in place. You know, and using that as the key document to prove who we are when we go down to the DMV. It's just, you know, out of control, I'd say just shut it down and the 2018 law should be just null and void and not followed because its again, its just out there in left field. So, that's my opinion.

Mr. Ryan: Phillip McGuire.

Phillip McGuire: Hello, I'm Phillip McGuire, M-C-G-U-I-R-E. I came down here form Boundary County, Bonners Ferry area. So I just wanted to talk about these rules. So, you are born with either your either male or female and, umm, some people may have some of the other parts but if you do other tests and more tests, you are either female or male. I believe this legislation is actually a threat to the female gender. It is because then people that males, or people with male parts, I should say, would want to participate in female sports which would give them an advantage and I also feel it's a threat to the safety of the future of my children, safety of my wife because there is going to be these male people that identify as female and I feel like my wife should have the right to carry an assault weapon just to protect herself to use the bathroom. In order to change the gender on birth certificates of live birth, the persons gender identity needs to match with the gender reality.

Mr. Ryan: Representative John Green.

Rep. John Green: I'm going to speak today from my own personal perspective but through the eyes of having now spent a year in the legislature. First of all, it could take us a year and we still would not have enough heating time to, for everybody to explain the reasons why this is such a bad idea but I want to take a different tact. I have no idea why God allows some people to be afflicted with what, from a normal standpoint we would call an anomaly. But this law, is not, this rule is not necessary. It is not necessary because of we already have a mechanism in law to address these kind of concerns. Now there are two kinds of two kinds of legal birth certificate documents and the legal decision-makers in the state couldn't tell me which was which but I am going to describe them this way. There is the one that is the factual record of the birth and there are three categories that a person maybe fall into. One would be male, one would be female, the other would be undetermined. I don't know what an undetermined means but that could be addressed at a later time and it could be addressed through a court. There is already a mechanism in place. The real underlying issue for me is preserving the rule of law. I am on the Health and Welfare Committee. I was not allowed to have a public hearing despite a request on this rule during this session of legislature. Thankfully, with the cooperation of the government, we killed all of the rules so now we are able to have some of these hearings. But the real issue is here, the purpose of the Health and Welfare Department is to carry out or fully implement those

statutes that the legislature has imposed for the executive branch and they don't get to make law. This is ruling from a federal court. A federal court has no, there is no mechanism, legal or otherwise, for the federal court to insinuate itself in the sovereign State of Idaho and our state officials in the executive branch need to tell the federal government you will not interfere with the sovereignty of the State of Idaho.

Mr. Ryan: Tina Stevens:

Tina Stevens: Hi, I'm Tina Stevens of Coeur d'Alene. As a former foster parent in the State of Idaho, I'm here for the children and my concern is if I am fostering a 12-year-old girl and then in the middle of the night, I am called by Health and Welfare and they say I have a 12-year-old girl that needs shelter right now. I bring that child in. I only have one bedroom, I put the two girls together and I find out one of them is biological male. What's going to happen to our foster care system? Are foster parents going to say I can only take one child or else withdraw completely? This is not good for our most vulnerable citizens which are our children. I'm concerned about many transgenders wanting to switch their gender from one day to the next. I understand the belief behind it, the feeling behind it, but can our government deal with that? Are we going to be switching birth certificates back and forth? As the director of Northwest Academy of Music for 25 years, overseeing education for thousands of children in our community, I know that as a vocal coach, I need to know if the vocal cords of the person are male or female because if we could coach it incorrectly, I could end up with a lawsuit and then pretty soon, our 30 year old business is no longer serving the citizens of our counties basically. My husband has done psychosocial rehabilitation for the State of Idaho. He has done foster care work in California and in north Idaho and he has a mentoring ministry to disadvantaged youth and his 40 years of experience says he believes that the vast majority of people suffering from gender issues have been sexually abused and many of them have been abused before they can remember. So my advice to all of you is pray that the issues that are really there would come to the surface and people would get the healing the help they need. I think it was the Justice Scalia, before he died, said beware America, that these changes we've had in our country in the last 15 years have resulted in this grand social experiment that goes against thousands of years of history. Thank you.

Mr. Ryan: Ray Millard.

Mr. Ryan: Heike Jahnert.

Heike Jahnert: Good morning, I'm Heike Jahnert, J-A-H-N-E-R-T, and you know, I'm just like this is crazy. Unelected bureaucrats rule over us now, yea unelected, and its not just with Health and Welfare, its with common care, you know the, it is in the education, common core. Its everywhere, and I came to this county 30 years ago and I thought, man I am coming to America and its free and guess what, you guys are not free. Its slipping away and you guys don't know because its so sudden you know and so I've really noticed all of these new amendments. You know, this is unelected bureaucrats. They are trying to change our society and we have to stand up. Also, I noticed 20 years ago, when they didn't say sex anymore,

it went to gender and people born 20 to 25 years ago. It's not going to stop there. They are then going to invent new genders. People born 20 to 25 years ago. Its sex. It always used to be sex. Its male or female and now its gender. While I can be whatever tomorrow. Also, you know think about it, big money is behind it. Transgender people need medical attention all their lives with the hormones and the doctor's visits. It's big money that's behind it. They want it. There is doctors behind it. So, think about that too and thank you for letting me speak.

Mr. Ryan: Stacy Rodriguez.

Stacy Rodriguez: Good morning. My name is Stacy Rodriguez, R-O-D-R-I-G-U-E-Z. Also, a California refugee and my career was as a deputy district attorney in San Diego County and, while there, in that capacity, I prosecuted Butcher Brown and sent him to prison for the rest of his life for butchering transgender surgeries. Now, I don't know if Ms. Taylor is post-gender reassignment surgery or preoperative but I will tell you that I have watched the videos on how its done by both a butcher and legitimate surgeon and it is not anything that anybody would want to see. It's a horrific experience. Now, according to the UCLA Law School, how many adults identify as transgender in the United States, that number was 0.58%. Glad put out a publication that said, "with the millennials, it might be as much as 3%." The point is that this thing that the department has done, first of all, it was sneaky. It was very sneaky and it's over-brought and overreaching. I agree with Representative Green. It is unnecessary to change the birth document that we have because, at least, at that point, in someone's life, except for some genetic anomalies like hermaphrodites, and I should mention that in prosecuting Butcher Brown, I interviewed for over eight months, 235 transgender people. Some were legit as if they had had the surgery by legitimate doctors, not Butcher Brown, and they were, except for two, miserable. Miserable with the life choice that they had made over time because things just weren't working out. The physical wasn't matching the mental no matter what they did. Fake boobs, estrogen injections if you are going male to female, a neovagina stuffed with a carpet pad to keep the space open because you don't have one. That causes people incredible pain. Do they need medical services, absolutely. Should they have mental health services, absolutely. Should they be able to change their gender on their birth certificate, I don't think so. As another speaker mentioned it would eviscerate women's sports. It would eviscerate women's sports. Just go look at the pictures. The athletes now aren't even bothering to transition in any way. They're not getting breasts. They're not taking estrogen. They just come one day, okay, I lost as a guy I'm going to compete on the girls team and you see these girls standing here and then a guy. Let's say you transition at 26. You've still been a man for 26 years and you have the musculature and all of the development that you have into your body at that time and that's why I cannot understand why women aren't objecting more. Have you ever seen a marathoner female beat a male? Have you ever seen, other than the rigged thing with Bobby Riggs and Billy Jean King, a female ever beat a male in tennis? In any sport? Why are they sitting back, all these mother's of daughters and saying "I don't care. Put the biological male on my daughter's team and let the women never win another sport." Thank you very much.

Mr. Ryan: Kristen LeBlanc.

Kristen LeBlanc: Good morning. First of all, I would like to say to Alexandra, it does take incredible courage to be here and we offer you our compassion and really hope that you are welcomed in churches around our nation and accepted for who you are. Having said that, I think changing sex on a birth certificate is a terrible idea. Specifically, I would like to speak as a mother of daughters. I also have sons. Sex is a biological fact. No matter how one feels, individuals with XX chromosomes are female and individuals with XY chromosomes are male. 0.017% of children born are known as intersex. That means that while they have an X or Y chromosome or an XX chromosome, there are physical indications that they might be both sexes but they're not. They do have X or Y or XX chromosomes. As a biological female, I fear the identification of biological males as female will irreparably harm the achievements of females, specifically, in athletics. Imagine a world in which biological females are not holding athletic records because biological males who identify as females outrun, outjump, outthrow, outlift, outswim, outperform them. Imagine a world in which adolescent and teenage girls suffer the embarrassment and invasion of privacy in locker rooms as teenage males who call themselves females disrobe, revealing external male organs. Girls who object to shared locker rooms will be vilified as hateful and bigoted. We are seeing that already. Men are competing as women in female athletics and they are beating them hands down. The citizens of Idaho will be burdened with the cost of implementing programs and policies for those that seek to ignore science and wield enormous power by vilifying those who raise legitimate scientific facts about biological sex. It is a misuse of administrative power to enact policies that do not benefit the citizens of Idaho, especially biological females. Finally, I'd like to end with a quote from Martina Navratilova. "To put the argument at its most basic, a man can decide to be female, take hormones if required by whatever sporting organization is concerned when everything in sight and perhaps earn a small fortune and then reverse his decision and go back to making babies if he so desires. It's insane and it's cheating. I am happy to address a transgender woman in whatever form she prefers but I would not be happy to compete against her. It would not be fair." Martina Navratilova.

Mr. Ryan: Ed McBurney.

Ed McBurney: Hi, I'm Ed McBurney and I would like to just add one little factor from experience in that I worked with a man that, at the age of 50 or 52, in that range, decided that he was going to have his name changed, so legally, a judge did change his name and I will refer to him as John and John, was a good technician. But John, after having the actual surgery done and after taking the hormones, I would not wish the results on any friend, including him. In the process, the hormones were playing real havoc on his health and welfare and he was at a point where he was constantly weeping about issues about him. He was in confusion. He could not advance in the expertise that he had developed because he was incapacitated by his emotions. I would not wish this on any friend or man nor would I wish it on any of our children to be thinking that they could have such a thing done and have no price paid for that decision. We don't need to add confusion to this confusing world that we already have. We rely upon God to sit things right. He has set his word so that we understand there is male and female and the science

backs it up. No matter what research has been developed, they have not found proof that when someone says I am another gender that the chromosomes do not change just because of they think so. So, for the sake of the welfare and health of the general population, we do not want to go against God's stated goal for us. His will is that we are male and female and I appreciate the statements that were made today and I just want to add the emphasis that it is not healthy for anyone to change nor should we encourage it by allowing various avenues. Thank you.

Mr. Ryan: Jeremy Lowery.

Jeremy Lowery: My name is Jeremy Lowery. I am a resident of Hayden. It is spelled L-O-W-E-R-Y. I'm a Christian. I'm a believer. I'm a minister but I'm not a theonist which is a person who believes that society should be run according to religious laws. So I want to make that statement and I want to address my Christian brothers and sisters that are in here. I have been appreciative of your comments but I am running out of time already so. You know, our founding fathers gave us a county that provided basic foundations and freedoms for all classes of people and I think that we need to be careful. The bible says to be examples, let your light shine, and have a lot worthy of the calling to which you are called so I think that we need to be an example and advocate for morality through non-legislative means in our society. We need to humble ourselves and pray as the bible says and let that be our primary form of activism. I am here today just to express my lack of support. I am against rule 160208 because of two reasons primarily. I have got a lot but I don't have time to say them all. The first of which is, I worked many years ago as a data scientist in the field of healthcare informatics. I lead a team of data scientists in researching healthcare data to improve healthcare outcomes for various groups of people. The genetic makeup of a male versus a female is very, very important. It is a primary slice in the data that you make to determine, you know, very important things in the research of pharmaceuticals, and therapy, safe therapies for people including transgender people and if we don't have that in the records of changing this going back, changing the document and then putting that document, the original document in a sealed case that is only obtainable by court order is going to make it very difficult for medical researchers to get that information and to get actionable research out of that. That's said, I think it is going to hurt the transgender community. It's going to make it less safe for them as we promote that kind of research. Secondly, I am addressing the culture more broadly. I am already down to that, okay. More broadly addressing the culture, I think that we have got a problem in America right now where we are solving the wrong problems for transgender people. According to the American Psychiatric Association's Diagnostic and Statistical Manual of Mental Disorders, gender dysuria is a disorder and, so it's a problem and we need to treat that. We need to help people. We need to embrace transgender people. We need to love them. They are people with a disorder and so we need to embrace them, we need to love them, and try to find ways to help them and support them in our culture but this is on the rise. This is happening. The rates of incidence of this is increasing, particularly in the area of children and there has been scholarly research. You can go out on _____. You can go out on the internet and get scholarly, peer reviewed studies that say that there is both social factors and physical factors, biological factors. There is research on endocrine disrupting

chemicals in our environment and in our food sources, contaminated water. There is also research that supports that a lot, and in particular in the area of rapid onset gender dysphoria in teenagers, there is evidence that says that there is strong influences in social vectors, social influences that are causing people to experience more symptoms of gender dysphoria. Somebody's friend comes out as transgender and all of the sudden, they come out as transgender so this is an ongoing thing. She is standing up because I have been taking so long. I prepped for five minutes, I am out of breath trying to get it all out. So this is something that is on the increase and we need to be reasonable in how we do this and how we support the transgender community through reasonable steps to get them the kind of care that they need but we shouldn't be just saying "hey this is a normal version of what existent is supposed to be on this planet by a human."

Mr. Ryan: Steve Tanner.

Steve Tanner: Hi, I'm Steve Tanner. I'm from Boundary County and there is several issues that I wanted to address. I am not sure the board, I got here kind of late but the court order, in my understanding was that we were violating the 14th amendment of the constitution at least the State of Idaho was in its use of these rules as far as seeking to change a birth certificate and reading from the court order as the policy of automatically rejecting application from transgender people is to change the sex listed on their birth certificates violates the Equal Protection Clause of the 14th amendment and, I believe there is a lot better ways to fit within the 14th amendment than by doing it in these ways that are listed in the policy. I think, specifically, six is lifted as in consideration for what we are considering today and the idea that we would automatically, the court order seems to promote that it automatically rejects them but you can take an application for a change but, if the fact is they are men and they are telling you they are women, the fact is we can still embrace truth in our land and say we will take your application but, you know, if it doesn't fit with truth, you don't have to approve it so those are the kind of things that we need to address if we are trying to fulfill the desire of a court order. I believe we failed where the attorney generals office failed in not appealing the ruling in the first place and not going forward with that but that's another issues. I haven't had time to look through all of that but it looks a little strange to me from what had happened. In a normal adversarial situation, you have two parties that are opposed to one another and if you have a court case in which you don't have opposed parties, you do not get a clear ruling and I believe this could be in that area of law. So, anyway, that specific objection. The other thing, one other point, was earlier in this, not the part that's being appealed, discussed today, is the part about changing a father on her birth certificate. It says it requires a court order, a court hearing, and a competent court. Certainly, we may be concerned about a competent court but the point is, is that if it requires a court order, it should require a court order to change their sex too. So, anyway.

Mr. Ryan: Alex Behrens.

Alex Behrens: My name is Alex Behrens. I am a resident of Kootenai County. I would like to discuss this issue from a bit of a legal thing that most people may not realize. One of the biggest oppositions to this issue is how this law was changed.

This law was changed because of there was a court decision, one man, now says that transgenderism is somewhat protected by the US Constitution, that judge. Then they made a rule but that rule was never heard by our representatives. These are the people who are supposed to be responsible to us so you will never get the people to agree if you attempt to force them into this but I would like to tell everyone here that Representative John Green and the house were so outraged that this rule was allowed to go into effect that they repealed all rules in Idaho rather than allow this rule to go into effect. That is how that happened. So it would be a good thing to continue to pray for our representatives and I believe, by the way, that you need to move this up and actually use stuff so I get the thing. One first thing is transgenderism is not recognized under the constitution nor the law of Idaho. It is not a protected class. So to try to say that it is is wrong. Transgenderism is not recognized under the federal law or the constitutional law. Race is. We have passed three constitutional amendments, a whole bunch of laws, and killed 600,000 people so the concept is that how are we going to implement this and have one person change and make this a recognized class, one person, without any input. I personally believe that if we had been allowed to argue this rule through the court there may have been a way for them to implement this in a way that didn't anger everyone. Now we have got to cut budgets and strip things because they have the power of the budget so we are now saying that if you don't cut this departments budget, because obviously they are in to too much stuff, that we are going to fire you. So, I would like to say, this rule, the way it was done was completely immoral, unethical, and undemocratic.

Mr. Ryan: That's everyone on the list today. Anyone say no that did want to testify that changed their mind.

Facilitator: Just for the record, this is Ducca Disney Spencer, facilitator of this and we have gone through all of the names of people who identified to testify and we did have some that deferred. We will go to those individuals now and, I believe this gentleman, raised his hand first. So, he can come up and take the podium and please state your name, spelling your last name. thank you.

Michael Lundy: My name is Michael Lundy, L-U-N-D-Y. Thanks for having the courage to stand up here and ask for help. Because of I am afraid for the adults. God's word says that it would be better had you not been born should you deceive one of these. In the schools, we have got the Rainbow Club and instead of helping our children and helping them through those difficult times, we're encouraging them and patting them on the back and then we are seeing the suicide rates going out of control because it is totally outside of God's realm and what his control is and what he intended for us as men and women. Of all the women in here at childbirth, did your doctor say, "Oh my God, come here look at this. What is it?" Somethings are just crazy and this legislation and all of this stuff that is happening, it doesn't make sense until you understand the underlying agenda of the dark side and there is a dark side you know it. Its called Satan and we are warned throughout scripture of his deceiving and he is the best liar that has ever been created. He is the prince of lies. He uses the truth but has it for a lying purpose and we are falling for that. California, hey thanks for coming up here and standing up and saying we don't want what's down there up here. But I'm afraid for the adults that are supporting

this kind of stuff and not reaching down and helping those kids because it's God's word. I think it's pretty straight up. Thank you. Oh, another thing, my son was telling me this morning, you were talking about the sports thing, this is not just happening, the records are being annihilated. They are not just being beat, they are being annihilated by the males operating as a female in sports. Thank you.

Facilitator: Is there anyone else who deferred that would now like to speak? Please come up and state your name for the record.

Elizabeth Hunt: Thank you.

Facilitator: And spell your last name.

Elizabeth Hunt: Thank you, my name is Elizabeth Hunt, H-U-N-T, and I will talk louder. I agree with everyone here. I prayed on the way here that you would all say the things that I did not have time to prepare to write down and you did so thank you all and thank you God. And so I just want to add, sorry I'm a little nervous, that on Saturday, there is a prayer vigil for Idaho and America going on at Athol Baptist Church from 5:30 PM to 7:00 PM. Everyone is welcome and seems there is a lot of prayer warriors in this group and so I just wanted to get the word out. Thank you.

Facilitator: Anyone else who deferred that would like to speak? Is there anyone who would like to speak? We have a few more minutes left. Is there anyone who, one individual back here. Please come up and state your name, spelling your last name. Thank you.

Diane Stockton: My name is Diane Stockton, S-T-O-C-K-T-O-N. I'm from Sand Point. Just because this is kind of a dressed at the minorities, I was born a female and I was also a tomboy. My mom asked me for my sixth birthday what I wanted. I said I wanted to be a boy. I don't remember what she said but it was probably something like that's impossible and I think it got a bike but I just want to say, if this law were true and passed, you know, my mom may have let me become a boy and I wouldn't have my beautiful children. My first grandchild is on the way. I can't imagine letting a child choose their gender at such a young age. So that's it.

Facilitator: We have about six minutes left, if there is anyone else who would like to speak and take their two minutes. Anyone else?

Male: Can I ask a question?

Facilitator: You can ask, I am not sure I can answer but you can ask it.

Male: Did I understand you early on to say that this was already a federal thing that was pushed through?

Facilitator: No sir, I did not say this is a federal.

Male: Okay.

Facilitator: I said it was through a federal court. The first court order is through a federal court. Thank you.

Female: I have a question.

Facilitator: This will be my last question. Please go ahead.

Female: Have you attended these sessions in any of the other counties and, if so, what is the reaction?

Facilitator: There has only been one other. It was in Louiston, yesterday and the record will be available.

Female: Can't you tell us now whether it leaned in one direction or another?

Facilitator: It was very similar to todays.

Female: Okay, thank you.

Female: Where can we find the record?

Facilitator: Well, we will submit the recordings and all of the written comments will be available through the Department of Health and Welfare Rules Unit. So we will see how we can get those made available to folks.

Female: Okay, so we can go to that website to find it?

Facilitator: No, you.

Female: Or the Department of Health and Welfare?

Facilitator: All of the comments will not be immediately available right there. There is a lot and there will probably be a summary of some sort that then is able to come out and all records are available through public records requests.

Female: Okay.

Facilitator: But there's a lot. I have a question in the back there.

Female: This is a question for our representatives, our elected officials here. What is the chance that the administrative role where it's passed as an entire package is going to be changed where we can pass department by department so that fewer instances of this kind of abuse of power are mitigated against?

Rep. Green: I'm happy to address that but probably afterwards because these people have the schedule but I'll stay as long as anybody wants to have questions about that process.

Facilitator: Thank you Representative Green, I appreciate that, because of that would not be part of the record of this hearing so thank you for that. Any other comments, questions for the representatives, which, thank you for coming. It's great to have you here. There's a lot of questions that your representatives can help you with. If there are no other questions, I will go ahead and close this meeting. Any last comments that anyone wants to make.

Female: Good job, Ducca.

Facilitator: Well thank you. Alright, I'll make the official closing comment. This public hearing started at 9:00 AM and is now closed. The time is 10:57 AM. The record of this hearing together was submitted. Written comments will be transmitted to the department's administrative rules unit. Anyone may submit further written comments to the rules unit at the Department of Health and Welfare, P.O. Box 83720, Boise, Idaho 83720-0036 or to DHWRules@dhw.idaho.gov. All written comments must be received by Wednesday, September 25, 2019, end of the day. If anyone has written comments from today that they would like to give to us and we will take back to the rules unit, you can hand them either to Ryan at the back or to myself and I have already collected a few from speakers. Thank you all very much. Excuse me, one question.

Female: I would like to know why microphones weren't provided so that people could hear.

Facilitator: That's a great point and I appreciate. The question was why we didn't provide microphones and I will assure that we have those. We have recorded the entire thing and I realize that was not enough for you in the back of the room so we will assure that we have microphones. So thank you for that and thank you all for a very informative and civil discussion this morning, I appreciate it. Thank you.